



REPORT ON A THESIS PRESENTED FOR A DEGREE BY RESEARCH

PART I PRELIMINARY REPORT

Part 1 reports are normally returned at least two weeks before the date of the oral examination. Please aim to complete the Part I report and return it within this timescale. The signed hard copy may be returned by post to <Colleges to insert their specific contact details>. Alternatively you may return it electronically from a University/Professional email address to: <Colleges to insert their specific contact details>.

This preliminary report should, wherever possible, be completed without consultation among the examiners. If you do find it necessary to consult at this stage, this fact and the reason(s) for it must be noted in the report.

Candidate's Details			
Name			
University User Number (UUN)			
Title of Thesis			
Degree	PhD <input type="checkbox"/>	EdD <input type="checkbox"/>	D Eng <input type="checkbox"/>
	DClinPsychol <input type="checkbox"/>	Other <input type="checkbox"/> For "other" please specify	
Examiner's Details			
Name			
Address			
e-mail		Tel	

ASSESSMENT OF THESIS

Please indicate your assessment below by ticking the appropriate box and adding your comments in the spaces provided. *(If necessary, please continue on a separate sheet)*

Is the thesis an original work that makes a significant contribution to knowledge in or understanding of the field of study? YES NO

Does the thesis contain material worthy of publication? YES NO

Does the thesis demonstrate adequate knowledge of the field of study and relevant literature? YES NO

Does the thesis show the exercise of critical judgement with regard to both the candidate's work and that of other scholars in the same general field? YES NO

Is the presentation and style of the thesis satisfactory? YES NO

General comments.

(Please include any corrections, minor modifications, substantial amendments or major revisions the candidate *MAY* be required to make following the viva.)

--

PRELIMINARY RECOMMENDATION

I understand that the examiners will hold an oral examination unless, for exceptional and special reasons, this is, waived by the College Postgraduate Studies Committee (or equivalent). It will be waived only if the Committee accepts my specific and reasoned recommendation to that effect (to be provided separately).

I RECOMMEND THAT AN ORAL EXAMINATION BE HELD:	<input type="checkbox"/>
Signature	Date

FOR COLLEGE USE ONLY
Date received:



REPORT ON A THESIS PRESENTED FOR A DEGREE BY RESEARCH

PART II POST EXAMINATION REPORT

If an oral examination is to be held, please detach and *retain* this part of the form and complete it (or another examiner's copy) *after* the oral examination. If an oral examination is *not* recommended, please leave this part blank and return it with the previous pages to the <Colleges to insert their specific contact details>.

Candidate's Details	
Name	
University User Number (UUN)	
Title of Thesis	
Degree	PhD <input type="checkbox"/> EdD <input type="checkbox"/> D Eng <input type="checkbox"/> DCLinPsychol <input type="checkbox"/>
	Other <input type="checkbox"/> For "other" please specify
Examiners' Details	
External Examiner(s)	1.
	2.
Internal Examiner(s)	1.
	2.
Others	
Non-Examining Chair (if applicable)	
Supervisor(s) if present	

FINAL RECOMMENDATION *AFTER* ORAL EXAMINATION

The examiners must report to the Committee *either* a joint recommendation or, if they are unable to reach agreement, separate recommendations, in one of the following forms:

The maximum period of further study allowed under the Postgraduate Regulations is 24 months. Please delete all but one of the following recommendations:

1. **(Reg a) Award PhD/Doctorate.** The candidate satisfies the requirements for the award of the doctorate degree as laid down in the Programmes of Study (see www.drps.ed.ac.uk/) as appropriate and the degree ought accordingly to be awarded; or
2. **(Reg b) Candidate to Carry out Corrections.** The candidate satisfies the requirements for the award of the degree except that editorial corrections are required or stated minor deficiencies in the thesis must be remedied. In the opinion of the examiners, the candidate will be able to remedy these shortfalls without further supervision and without undertaking any further original research. The amendments are to be completed within three months, and to be subject to certification by the internal examiner(s), and by the external examiner (where the examiner so requests), before the degree is awarded; or
3. **(Reg c) Candidate to Rectify Major Deficiencies.** The candidate is substantially deficient in one or more of the requirements for the degree, but appears capable of so revising the thesis as to satisfy them. The candidate ought therefore to be invited to resubmit the thesis in a substantially revised form along lines indicated by the examiners within a further period of study which should normally not exceed 12 months, but exceptionally shall not exceed 24 months; *or*
4. **(Reg d) Award MPhil.** That the candidate is substantially deficient in one or more of the requirements for the degree and appears not capable of so revising the thesis as to satisfy them; but the thesis satisfies the requirements for the degree of MPhil; or
5. **(Reg e) Candidate to Aim for MPhil – No thesis resubmission is necessary.** That the candidate is substantially deficient in one or more of the requirements for the degree of PhD and appears not capable of so revising the thesis as to satisfy them. However, the thesis satisfies the requirements for the degree of MPhil except for stated minor corrections in the thesis. Accordingly, the candidate should be invited to carry out the specified minor amendments along lines indicated by the examiners. The amendments are to be completed within three months, and the degree awarded subject to certification by the internal examiner(s), and by the external examiner (where the examiner so requests), before the degree is awarded; or
6. **(Reg f) Candidate to Aim for MPhil – Corrections needed and Thesis resubmission is necessary.** That the candidate is substantially deficient in one or more of the requirements for the degree of PhD and appears not capable of so revising the thesis as to satisfy them. However, the thesis satisfies the requirements for the degree of MPhil except for stated deficiencies in the thesis. Accordingly, the candidate should be invited to resubmit the thesis in an appropriately revised form for the degree of MPhil. The revisions should be completed within a further period which shall not exceed 12 months, or
7. **(Reg g) Award Masters by Research.** That the thesis and/or the candidate's defence of it in oral examination are so fundamentally deficient in respect of all or any of the requirements for the degree that the candidate ought not to be awarded the degree of PhD nor MPhil. However, the work is of sufficient quality to merit the award of Masters by Research.
8. **(Reg h) Fail.** That the thesis and/or the candidate's defence of it in oral examination are so fundamentally deficient in respect of all or any of the requirements for the degree that the candidate ought neither to be awarded the degree of PhD nor a taught professional doctorate, nor to be invited to resubmit the thesis for any degree of the University.



REPORT ON A THESIS PRESENTED FOR A DEGREE BY RESEARCH

REPORT OF NON-EXAMINING CHAIR

Please return to <Colleges to insert their specific contact details>.

Candidate's Name

Chair's Name

Are you satisfied that the examination was conducted in accordance with the regulations and procedures of the University? YES NO

If not, please explain the reasons for any concerns relating to the conduct of the viva (Please continue on a separate sheet if necessary)

Were you called upon to provide advice to the examiners or candidate? If so what advice was provided? YES NO

Did the examiners raise any matters in relation to the conduct of the examination? YES NO

Did the candidate raise any matters pertaining to the arrangement or conduct of the examination? YES NO

Signature

Date

Name:

EXTRACTS FROM THE POSTGRADUATE REGULATIONS
GROUNDS FOR AWARD OF PhD, MPhil AND MASTERS BY RESEARCH

Extract from the University's Degree Regulations and Programmes of Study

1. PhD by Research

The Grounds for award for the degree of PhD by research are:

(a) The candidate must have demonstrated by the presentation of a thesis and by performance at an oral examination (unless this is exceptionally waived) that the candidate is capable of pursuing original research in the field of study, relating particular research projects to the general body of knowledge in the field, and presenting the results of the researches in a critical and scholarly way.

(b) The thesis must be an original work making a significant contribution to knowledge in or understanding of the field of study and containing material worthy of publication; show adequate knowledge of the field of study and relevant literature; show the exercise of critical judgement with regard to both the candidate's work and that of other scholars in the same general field; contain material which presents a unified body of work such as could reasonably be achieved on the basis of three years postgraduate study and research; be satisfactory in its literary presentation, give full and adequate references and have a coherent structure understandable to a scholar in the same general field with regard to intentions, background, methods and conclusions.

(c) Length of Thesis: Within the Colleges of Humanities and Social Science and Medicine and Veterinary Medicine, the PhD thesis must not exceed 100,000 words. The thesis for the PhD in Fine Art must not exceed 50,000 words. Within the College of Science and Engineering the PhD thesis must not exceed 70,000 words. In exceptional circumstances, on the recommendation of the supervisor, permission may be granted by the College to exceed the stated length on the ground that such extension is required for adequate treatment of the thesis topic.

(d) For the award of PhD in Fine Art, in addition to the above, the candidate will be required to submit an exhibit in accordance with the requirements laid down by the Edinburgh College of Art.

The grounds for award of the degree of PhD for Musical Composition in Music are:

(a) The candidate must have demonstrated by the presentation of a portfolio of compositions* and by interview at an oral examination (unless this is exceptionally waived) that the candidate is capable of original composition to a high creative level.

(b) The portfolio of compositions must comprise original work suitable for professional performance and worthy of publication; must show competence in the ancillary technical skills appropriate to the chosen style; must contain material which presents a body of work such as could reasonably be achieved on the basis of three years' postgraduate study; must be satisfactory in its presentation and intelligible to any musician who might have to use it.

(c) The portfolio of compositions should normally include at least one major and extended work. A shorter submission may be accepted in the case of electronic compositions.

(d) The portfolio of compositions should be the result of work done mainly while the candidate is registered for this degree. If a substantial part of the portfolio was completed before registration for the degree, the candidate should indicate this in the declaration and identify the part of the portfolio so completed.

2. *MPhil by Research*

The Grounds for award of the degree of MPhil by Research are:

- (a) The candidate must have demonstrated by the presentation of a thesis* and by written and/or oral examination that the candidate has acquired an advanced level of knowledge and understanding in the field of study, is capable of relating knowledge of particular topics to the broader field of study involved and of presenting such knowledge in a critical and scholarly way.
- (b) The thesis must be a significant work comprising a satisfactory record of research undertaken by the candidate, or a satisfactory critical survey of knowledge in the approved field of study; show competence in the appropriate method of research and/or an adequate knowledge of the field of study; exhibit independence of approach or presentation; be satisfactory in literary presentation and include adequate references.
- (c) Within the Colleges of Humanities and Social Science and Medicine and Veterinary Medicine, the thesis must not exceed 60,000 words. Within the College of Science and Engineering the thesis must not exceed 50,000 words. In exceptional circumstances, on the recommendation of the supervisor, permission may be granted by the College to exceed the stated length on the ground that such extension is required for adequate treatment of the thesis topic.

The grounds for award of the degree of MPhil for Musical Composition in the School of Arts, Culture and the Environment are:

- (a) The candidate must have demonstrated by the presentation of a portfolio of compositions* and by oral examination that the candidate is capable of original composition to a high level.
- (b) The portfolio of compositions must comprise original work suitable for professional performance; must show competence in the ancillary technical skills appropriate to the chosen style; must be satisfactory and intelligible in its presentation.
- (c) The portfolio of compositions should include at least one extended work. A shorter submission may be accepted in the case of electronic compositions.

3. *Masters by Research degrees*

In addition to any requirements as detailed in the relevant Degree Programme Table the following grounds for award will apply to all Masters by Research Degrees:

- (a) The certified completion of research training plus other designated projects and/or assignments and/or course work, and the completion of a dissertation. The assessed work, including the dissertation, should be equivalent to but not exceeding 30,000 words. The dissertation, which may comprise the total of the assessed material, or a part only, in which case that part must be worth at least 60 points out of the total 180 points required for the award of the degree. Assessments of the various elements may be made separately or together at the end of the programme.
- (b) The completion of any required research training and have demonstrated by the presentation of work specified above that he/she has acquired an advanced level of knowledge and understanding in the field of study and is capable of undertaking independent research.
- (c) The portfolio of projects or dissertation submitted should comprise either a satisfactory record of research undertaken by the candidate, or a satisfactory critical survey of knowledge in the field of study, or both combined with a satisfactory plan for a more advanced research project; and show competence in the appropriate

Revised November 2011

method of research and an adequate knowledge of the field of study. The work must be satisfactory in its literary presentation and include adequate references.

4. Taught Professional Doctorates

The grounds for the award of Taught Professional Doctorates are:

- (a) The candidate must have demonstrated by the presentation of a thesis and by written and/or oral examination that the candidate has acquired an advanced level of knowledge and understanding in the field of study, is capable of relating knowledge of particular topics to the broader field of study involved and of presenting such knowledge in a critical and scholarly way;
- (b) The thesis must be a significant work comprising a satisfactory record of original research undertaken by the candidate, or a satisfactory critical survey of knowledge in the approved field of study; show competence in the appropriate method of research and/or an adequate knowledge of the field of study; exhibit independence of approach or presentation; be satisfactory in literary presentation and include adequate references.
- (c) Candidates are also required to take classes and pass examinations during their period of study, as specified in the relevant degree programme tables and handbooks.