

**MINUTE OF A MEETING** of the University Court of the University of Edinburgh held in Room 1.0, Main Library, George Square on Monday 20 June 2011.

**Present:** Dr J Markland, Vice-Convener (in chair)  
The Principal  
Mr D A Connell  
Professor A M Smyth  
Dr M Aliotta  
Professor J Ansell  
Professor S Monro  
Mr M Murray  
Ms A Richards  
Ms G Stewart  
Mr D Brook  
Mr M McPherson, President Students' Representative Council  
Mr M Williamson, Vice-President Students' Representative Council

**In attendance:** Vice-Principal Professor A McMahon  
Senior Vice-Principal Professor N Brown  
Vice-Principal Professor J Haywood  
Vice-Principal Professor D Hounsell ( for papers C8 and C9 only)  
Vice-Principal Professor D Miell  
Dr K Waldron, University Secretary  
Mr N Paul, Director of Corporate Services  
Dr I Conn, Director of Communications and Marketing  
Mr A Currie, Director of Estates and Buildings  
Mr J Gorringe, Director of Finance  
Ms S Gupta, Director of Human Resources  
Ms F Boyd, Principal's Policy and Executive Officer  
Dr T Harrison, Director of Academic Standards and Quality Assurance (for papers C8 and C9 only)  
Mr A Johnston, General Council Assessor elect  
Dr C Masters, Co-opted Court Member designate  
Dr K J Novosel, Head of Court Services

**Apologies:** The Rector  
Mrs M Tait  
Professor D Finnegan  
Professor L Yellowlees  
The Rt Hon G Grubb, Lord Provost of the City of Edinburgh  
Professor J Barbour  
Mr P Budd  
Mr D Workman  
Ms S Beattie-Smith, Rector's Assessor

This meeting of Court was preceded by a presentation by Dr Gavin McCabe, Employability Consultant, Careers Service on 'Employability and Graduate Attributes'.

## **A FORMAL BUSINESS**

subject to a correction in the list of those attending and to the insertion in item 1 of the substantive items, Report on Other item, paragraph 2, line 5 of 'the production of' before 'data'.

Court further noted that this would be the last meeting to be attended by Dr John Markland, Ms Gill Stewart and Mr Douglas Connell. Court thanked them most warmly for their significant contributions to the work of Court and its Committees and wished them well in the future.

Court further noted that Professor Lesley Yellowlees had resigned from the position of Senate Assessor and in her absence Court recorded its thanks for her contribution to Court noting that she would be in attendance at future meetings as Vice-Principal and Head of the College of Science and Engineering. Court also noted that Vice-Principal Professor McMahon would be leaving the University at the end of July and Court wished her well in her new position as Vice-Chancellor of Aberystwyth University.

## **B PRINCIPAL'S BUSINESS**

### **1 PRINCIPAL'S COMMUNICATIONS**

**Paper B1**

Court noted the items within the Principal's report and the additional information on: the launch of a third Global Academy - Global Environment and Society Academy; continuing issues in respect of the work of the UK Border Agency; the announcement by the Scottish Education Secretary of a review of University governance arrangements; the success of the Scottish Funding Council dialogue visit and the welcomed participation by three Court members; on-going discussions with the Principal of Heriot-Watt University; recent engagement events at the Scottish Parliament; the securing of £15m for the Climate Change Centre; recent media interest in a fake blogger allegedly a student at the University; the production of the first EUSA Volunteering Opportunities Annual Report; the series of events to mark the birth of David Hume in 1711; new finds in the Old Quad relating to Joseph Black; and the University open day in June.

### **2 VICE-PRINCIPALS AND ASSISTANT PRINCIPALS**

**Paper B2**

On the recommendation of the Principal, Court approved the following:

#### eca Principal

Dr Christopher Breward to be appointed Principal of eca within the University of Edinburgh, Vice-Principal of the University and to be awarded a Personal Chair; these appointments and positions to commence at a date to be agreed in September 2011.

#### Designation of Vice-Principal

Professor Charlie Jeffery to be designated Vice-Principal Public Policy with effect from 1 August 2011 for a period of three years.

#### Assistant Principals

Professor Martin Siegert's term of office as Assistant Principal, Energy and Climate Change to be extended for two years until 31 October 2013.

Dr Tina Harrison to be designated Assistant Principal, Academic Standards and Quality Assurance with effect from 1 August 2011 for a period of two years.

### 3 **REPORT OF OUTCOME OF COURT TRIBUNAL**

Court at its meeting on 20 December 2010 approved the appointment of a Tribunal to consider disciplinary charges brought against a member of the academic staff. Court noted that the Tribunal had now met and had recommended dismissal of the member of staff. The Principal had accepted this recommendation.

### **C SUBSTANTIVE ITEMS**

#### 1 **REPORT OF THE FINANCE AND GENERAL PURPOSES COMMITTEE**

Dr Markland presented the papers previously circulated.

##### Report of the Central Management Group meeting of 25 May 2011

**Paper C1.1**

Court endorsed the proposal that there should be a member of Court on the Ethical Fundraising Advisory Group and welcomed the establishment of this Group and of the Recruitment and Admissions Strategy Group which would include within its remit consideration of widening access issues. Assurances were provided on the activities already underway in respect of student recruitment and admissions matters around the merger with the Edinburgh College of Art. Court further noted that the Staff Committee had established a Sub-Committee to take forward consideration of staff performance and development review issues which would report back to the Staff Committee and thereon to Court in due course. It was also noted that the Trans Equality Policy would be widely disseminated and training offered to HR and other appropriate individuals across the University: the policy covered both students and staff.

##### Report on Other Items

**Paper C1.2**

The continuing strong financial position of the University was noted and the satisfactory discussions with the European Investment Bank.

##### Undergraduate bursaries and Postgraduate scholarships

**Paper C1.2  
Appendix 6**

Court noted that there had been detailed debate at the Finance and General Purposes Committee on the University strengthening the funds it already made available to support scholarships and bursaries in the light of the forecast surplus for 2010/2011. Appendix 6 of the report had been prepared following the meeting of the Finance and General Purposes Committee and set out proposals in respect of this issue for consideration by Court.

Court noted the information on the breakdown of the forecast favourable variance and those elements relating to Colleges and Support Groups and to the central area of the University. Court further noted the net favourable variance once non-cash and committed expenditure/carry forward reserves had been excluded. The proposals set out in the paper related to both undergraduate and postgraduate students taking cognisance of sustainability issues, anticipated returns should the net favourable variance be invested in an endowment-type fund and current levels of support and suggested that additional funding of at least £125,000 should be made available for each of the next four years.

There was full support for increasing the University's contribution to undergraduate bursaries and postgraduate scholarships however there was not a consensus view on the appropriate level of that increase. The debate took full cognisance of the financial environment and uncertainties on future funding of the higher education sector in Scotland as well as the University's capital expenditure aspirations and the need to honour the expectations of Colleges and Support Groups regarding the measures

undertaken to date to secure reserves to offset future financial challenges.

In accordance with the Standing Orders of Court a motion was put before Court that the total net favourable variance currently forecast at £2.4m be committed to undergraduate bursaries and postgraduate scholarships. The motion was formally proposed and seconded. An amendment was also proposed and seconded that an allocation process should be undertaken to identify all possible uses of these funds. The Court agreed to vote on the motion and amendment by a show of hands. The majority of Court members present voted for the amendment and further information and proposals would be presented to a future Court meeting on the allocation of the forecast net favourable variance of £2.4m following appropriate reflection on the Court discussions. Mr Douglas Connell, General Council Assessor asked that his personal disappointment that this decision had been reached be recorded in the Minute of this meeting.

## **2 EDINBURGH COLLEGE OF ART**

The Director of Corporate Services presented the papers previously circulated.

### Overview

**Paper C2.1**

The main developments in the implementation of the merger were noted, in particular the appointment as previously approved of a new Principal for eca within the University and the arrangements to put in place a robust administrative structure. There were some matters still to be fully resolved and these were being actively progressed. Court further welcomed the continuing communications with student and staff. Assurances were provided on the process to fully integrate eca with the University's procedures and Court approved the proposals for monitoring and reviewing the implementation of the merger including the continuation of a post merger working group encapsulating the activities of the operational and academic working groups. Court further approved the proposal to establish a working group of Court towards the end of the next academic session to undertake a formal review.

### Annual Reports and Financial Statements

**Paper C2.2**

It was noted that the Finance and General Purposes Committee and the Audit Committee had reviewed and endorsed the proposed approach to signing off the eca Accounts and the Andrew Grant Scholarship Fund Accounts for the year ending 31 July 2011. Court was content to approve the proposals.

### Andrew Grant Scholarship Fund

**Paper C2.3**

Court noted that as from the merger date of 1 August 2011 it would become the single corporate Trustee of the Andrew Grant Bequest and the holder of the other eca endowments. This was in accordance with SSI: Edinburgh College of Art (Transfer) Scotland Order 2011 and Court approved the proposals in respect of the discharge of its duties on the management and dispersal of these funds as set out in the paper.

## **3 REVIEW OF COURT EFFECTIVENESS - UPDATE REPORT**

**Paper C3**

Court noted the outcome of the review of the effectiveness of the Committee on University Benefactors, the Remuneration Committee and the Staff Committee and that two Court Committees were still to report on the review of their effectiveness. Court further approved the minor amendment to the terms of reference of the Committee on University Benefactors. Court welcomed the proposed approach to introduce a mentoring scheme for new Court members and endorsed the proposal that this scheme be extended to external members of Court Committees.

- 4 UNIVERSITY RISK REGISTER Paper C4**
- It was noted that the Risk Management Committee had undertaken a more extensive review of the Register than usual this year and that the revised University Risk Register had been considered by the Finance and General Purposes Committee and Audit Committee with suggested amendments appropriately incorporated into the current version. Court noted the significant areas of revision particularly the addition of four new risks including that associated with a review of University governance structure by the Scottish Government and suggested amendments to the current likelihood scores for risk 7 and risk 4 to probable and likely respectively thus altering the ordering of these two risks on the Register. Subject to the above revision, Court approved the revised University Risk Register and the University Risk Policy Statement.
- 5 REPORT FROM ESTATES COMMITTEE Paper C5**
- Court approved the various recommendations as set out on the coversheet and noted in particular the revised speculative priority programme, the next group of priority projects and the issues around the Darwin Building.
- 6 REPORT FROM AUDIT COMMITTEE Paper C6**
- The draft minute of the last meeting of the Audit Committee was noted including the satisfactory review of the external audit service. Court approved the Internal Audit Plans 2011/2012 and the external audit fees for 2010/2011 on the recommendation of the Audit Committee. The requirement to prepare Accounts in accordance with US GAAP was also noted and the University's proposed approach approved including the anticipated external audit fees. Court further noted and welcomed the actions being taken by the Audit Committee in respect of the arrangements for signing off eca Accounts.
- 7 REPORT FROM KNOWLEDGE STRATEGY COMMITTEE Paper C7**
- Court noted this report and the activities undertaken by the Knowledge Strategy Committee.
- 8 ENHANCED QUALITY ASSURANCE ANNUAL REPORT Paper C8**
- Court welcomed the production of this Annual Report which had been prepared in response to a request by Court to receive routine information on the enhancement activities undertaken within the University. The current approach to enhancement and the elements of organisational structure, strategic focus, facilitation and guiding principles were endorsed noting shared responsibilities for enhancement across the University in line with the devolved structure. Court further noted the highlighted activities in 2010/2011 and particularly commended the establishment of the Institute of Academic Development and the rewarding and sharing of good practice.
- 9 ENHANCEMENT-LED INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW (ELIR) - REFLECTIVE ANALYSIS Paper C9**
- It was noted that the full Reflective Analysis was an extensive document prepared prior to the Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) visits to the University in October and November 2011. The document, which will be published in early September 2011, summarised the University's approach to improving student learning and to securing the academic standards of its awards and reflected on developments since the last ELIR. The sections presented in the paper provided Court with an overview of the contents of the document including the conclusion section. Court fully endorsed the document noting that it had been considered and approved by the Senate Quality Assurance

Committee.

**10            ORDINANCE FOR THE ELECTION OF CHANCELLOR AND GENERAL COUNCIL ASSESSORS            Paper C10**

Court at its meeting on 21 February 2011 had approved the consultation of the draft of this Ordinance and it was noted that no observations had been received during the consultation period except in respect of further suggested amendments from the Privy Council. Their amendments were of a minor nature and included a proposed change in the title of the Ordinance and some rewording of one of the sections; the General Council had confirmed that the proposed amendments were acceptable. Court sought clarification on the scope of the Ordinance and background information was provided to new members on the rationale for preparing this Ordinance. It was noted that the driving force had been to enable the expedient introduction of improved good practice and specifically to allow on-line voting; the current Ordinance being very proscriptive. Court approved the revised Ordinance which incorporated the suggested amendments and asked that formal approval now be sought from the Privy Council.

**11            SCOTTISH AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE            Paper C11**

Court fully endorsed the proposals to take forward further negotiations with the Scottish Agricultural College to increase collaboration between the two Institutions.

**12            RECTORIAL ELECTION            Paper C12**

The current Rector's term of office would cease at the end of February 2012 and Court approved the proposed approach for the 2012 election including that on-line voting take place over 8 and 9 February 2012 subject to consultation with Senate. Court also approved the appointment of Lord Cameron as Returning Officer and Dr Alexis Cornish as Deputy Returning Officer. A paper setting out the detailed arrangements would be drafted for consideration at the next meeting of Court. There was discussion on when the on-line voting should close and it was agreed to consult further with EUSA on this matter prior to finalising arrangements.

**D ITEMS FOR FORMAL APPROVAL OR NOTE**

**1            ACADEMIC REPORT            Paper D1**

Court noted the very productive meeting of the Senate held on 8 June 2011 and further noted confirmation of the resignation of Professor Yellowlees as Senate Assessor. Court would be notified in due course of the outcome of the election for a new Senate Assessor.

**2            SENATE COMMITTEES' ANNUAL REPORT            Paper D2**

Court noted this very informative report on the activities of the Senate Committees.

**3            RESOLUTIONS            Paper D3**

Court approved the following Resolutions:

- Resolution No. 4/2011: Institution of new postgraduate Degree: Master of Public Health
- Resolution No. 5/2011: Institution of new postgraduate Degree: Master of Surgery (General Surgery)
- Resolution No. 6/2011: Merger with Edinburgh College of Art
- Resolution No. 7/2011: Foundation of Chairs associated with merger with Edinburgh College of Art

Resolution No. 8/2011: Merger with Edinburgh College of Art: Institution of new postgraduate Degrees

Resolution No. 9/2011: Merger with Edinburgh College of Art: Institution of new undergraduate Degrees

Resolution No. 10/2011: Revocations associated with the merger with Edinburgh College of Art

Resolution No. 11/2011: Foundation of the Handa Chair of Japanese-Chinese Relations

Resolution No. 12/2011: Foundation of a Chair of Veterinary Immunology

Resolution No. 13/2011: Foundation of a Chair of Resilience Biology

Resolution No. 14/2011: Foundation of the Anne Rowling Chair of Tissue Regeneration

Resolution No. 15/2011: Amendment to Resolution No. 45/2006

Resolution No. 16/2011: Institution of new postgraduate Degree: Master of Public Policy

Resolution No. 17/2011: Postgraduate Degree Programme Regulations

Resolution No. 18/2011: Undergraduate Degree Programme Regulations

Resolution No. 19/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Dependable Systems

Resolution No. 20/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Systems Neurobiology

Resolution No. 21/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Extragalactic Astrophysics

Resolution No. 22/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Tissue Stem Cell Biology

Resolution No. 23/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Politics

Resolution No. 24/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Psychology of Language and Cognition

Resolution No. 25/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Coordination Chemistry

Resolution No. 26/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of History

Resolution No. 27/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Reproductive Neuroendocrinology

Resolution No. 28/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Systems Immunology

Resolution No. 29/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Software Systems Modelling

Resolution No. 30/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Student Learning (English for Academic Purposes)

Resolution No. 31/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Molecular and Experimental Neuroimaging

Resolution No. 32/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Social Psychology

Resolution No. 33/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Primary Care E-Health

Resolution No. 34/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Architectural Practice

Resolution No. 35/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Forest Science

Resolution No. 36/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Communications, Arts and Religion

Resolution No. 37/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Glaciology

Resolution No. 38/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Health Geography

Resolution No. 39/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Scottish Private Law

Resolution No. 40/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Microbial Pathogenesis

Resolution No. 41/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Ecology

Resolution No. 42/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Public Policy and Citizenship

Resolution No. 43/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Signal Processing and Communications

Resolution No. 44/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Web Informatics  
Resolution No. 45/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Paediatric  
Gastroenterology and Nutrition  
Resolution No. 46/2011: Foundation of a Personal Chair of Ion Channel  
Physiology and Pharmacology

#### **4 DONATIONS AND LEGACIES**

**Paper D4**

Court was pleased to note the donations and legacies to be notified received by the University of Edinburgh, Development Trust between 1 May 2011 and 1 June 2011.

#### **5 USE OF THE SEAL**

A record was made available of all the documents executed on behalf of the Court since its last meeting and sealed with its common seal.

#### **6 VACATION COURT**

In accordance with normal practice Court approved the appointment of a vacation Court, comprising the Rector failing whom the Vice-Convener of Court, the Principal and the University Secretary, to deal with urgent formal business.

Court noted that discussions were on-going with the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (BBSRC) regarding the provision of an Avian research facility at the Roslin Institute at the University. There were significant financial implications for the University and it was noted that decisions may require to be taken before the next meeting of Court. It was therefore agreed that a Sub-Committee of the Finance and General Purposes Committee comprising the Vice-Convener of Court (Dr Markland or Professor Monro), Director of Finance, Director of Estates and Buildings and the Vice-Principal with responsibility for planning and resources (Vice-Principal Professor McMahon or Senior Vice-Principal Professor Brown) be given delegated authority to consider the business case for the above project and thereon make recommendations to the Vacation Court on a way forward.